



MONTCLAIR STATE
UNIVERSITY

Montclair State University
**Montclair State University Digital
Commons**

John J. Cali School of Music Scholarship and
Creative Works

John J. Cali School of Music

2-2016

From the Margins: The Underrepresentation of Black and Latino Students/Teachers in Music Education

Lisa C. DeLorenzo

Montclair State University, deloranzol@mail.montclair.edu

Marissa Silverman

Montclair State University, silvermanm@mail.montclair.edu

Follow this and additional works at: <https://digitalcommons.montclair.edu/cali-facpubs>



Part of the [Music Education Commons](#), and the [Music Pedagogy Commons](#)

MSU Digital Commons Citation

DeLorenzo, Lisa C. and Silverman, Marissa, "From the Margins: The Underrepresentation of Black and Latino Students/Teachers in Music Education" (2016). *John J. Cali School of Music Scholarship and Creative Works*. 32.

<https://digitalcommons.montclair.edu/cali-facpubs/32>

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by the John J. Cali School of Music at Montclair State University Digital Commons. It has been accepted for inclusion in John J. Cali School of Music Scholarship and Creative Works by an authorized administrator of Montclair State University Digital Commons. For more information, please contact digitalcommons@montclair.edu.

From the Margins: The Underrepresentation of Black and Latino Students/Teachers in Music Education

By

Lisa C. DeLorenzo
Montclair State University

Marissa Silverman
Montclair State University

Abstract

There is an alarming gap between rising numbers of minority students and a shrinking minority teaching force. The purpose of this research was to explore the question: Why are so few students of color preparing to teach music in the public schools? Black and Latino music students and teachers who graduated from urban high schools in northern New Jersey were interviewed about their race/ethnic related experiences in college along with their ideas about the scarcity of music students of color in music teacher education. Data, presented in narrative form, indicated a complex web of factors that discourage high school students from considering a career in music teaching. Consequently, this research emphasizes the importance of listening to the voices of those who have been marginalized before suggesting solutions for how we recruit and educate students of color.

Key Words: Black, African American, Latino, Hispanic, marginalization, music education, students of color, minority students, music teaching, teacher preparation

Introduction and Literature Review

Our research emanates from a single yet deceptively complex question: Why are there so few Black and Latino students preparing to teach music in the public schools? We start with this question because it relates, in part, to the alarming gap between rising numbers of minority school students and a shrinking minority teaching force not just in music but in the entire education profession as well (Boser, 2011; Spearman, 1999; Tyler, Whiting, Ferguson, Eubanks, Steinberg, Scatton, & Bassett, 2011). Nationwide, students of color comprise 40% of the student population in the public schools as compared with 17% of the teacher population designating teachers of color (Boser, 2011). In music education, this disparity has not gone unnoticed (i.e., Bergee, 2001; Palmer, 2011; Spearman, 1999), yet, we remain in the infancy stage of addressing race/ethnicity as related to preparing and retaining minority music teachers.

In her commissioned report, Spearman (1999) identified at least two key reasons why minority teachers play such a critical role in the music education of our children. First, minority teachers serve as important models for both children of color and children of non-color. For children of color, it is especially critical that they see music teachers who not only look like them but also represent successful professionals in the field (Bierda & Chait, 2011; Lucas & Robinson, 2003; Quioco, 2000). Second, minority teachers give a unique voice and perspective in defining the music curriculum.

Demographics and Characteristics of High School Music Students

Some clues about minority student representation come from studies of who participates in high school music ensembles. Elpus and Abril (2011) conducted a study of music students from 750 American schools and found that the overwhelming number of

students participating in school ensembles were White. Earlier studies (Gillespie & Hamann, 1988; Smith, 1997) showed similar findings. According to Elpus and Abril (2011), the absence of students of color in school ensembles “should be of great concern to the music education practitioners and researchers” (p. 141).

Bergee (2001) surveyed 430 high school students on the kinds of events, persons, or other experiences that influenced students to major in music education. Findings indicated that the strongest influences on students’ choice to pursue music education were the support of high school music teachers and parents/guardians, school ensembles, and participation in All State/district ensembles, festivals, and music camps. Additionally, Rickles, Council, Fredrickson, and Hairston (2010) found that not only were high school music teachers extremely influential in their students choosing music education as a career, but students having positive music experiences, and music leadership experiences (i.e. section leader, conductor) had a sizeable impact as well. In terms of race/ethnicity, Bergee (2001) concluded, “If the ethnic profile for this sample indeed represents the ethnic profile of all collegiate music educators, then we must initiate intensive recruitment into music teaching of ethnic minorities and members of historically underrepresented groups” (p. 7).

Barriers that Urban Minority Students Face Regarding Music Participation

Urban minority students, in particular, face many barriers in the process of acquiring musical training. In the large urban public schools, students encounter a variety of issues that set them apart from students in more affluent schools.

Socio Economic Status (SES) factors. Much attention has focused on SES factors as a substantive barrier for urban students (i.e., Albert, 2006; Bierda & Chait,

2011; Costa-Giomi & Chappell, 2007; Elpus & Abril, 2011; Kinney, 2010). It is no secret that music training is expensive. Private lessons, music camps, festivals, instrument purchase or rental, and participation in outside music groups, all of which play a large role in preparing students to major in music, often cost more than a family with low SES is able to afford (Bergee, 2001; DeLorenzo, 2012a). Yet, Bergee's research (2001) indicated that these were strong characteristics of students who showed interest in music education as a career.

When considering SES and urban schools, the probability of poverty in urban schools with high concentrations of Black and Latino students is almost six times as high when compared to schools with a large percentage of White students (Kozol, 2005). Not surprisingly, a severe lack of resources, including those for many music programs, highlights the disparity between urban schools and more affluent schools. Even within the *same* district, Costa-Giomi and Chappel (2007) noted fewer financial resources in schools with large numbers of disadvantaged children than in schools with a high proportion of advantaged students.

Access to quality education. Along with inadequate resources, urban schools often fall short when it comes to excellence in educational experiences. According to Bierda and Chait (2011), "effective instruction has more influence on student performance than do other resources within the school" (p. 2). In addition, the literature indicates that urban schools suffer from tremendous teacher turnover (Bierda & Chait, 2011; Haberman, 1999; Kopetz, Lease, & Warren-Kring, 2006; Olsen & Anderson, 2007). This often leaves teaching in the hands of the youngest, most inexperienced teachers. The unique challenges of the urban school (Fitzpatrick, 2011) and lack of

adequate training in most teacher preparation programs prevent many capable teachers from applying (Baker, 2012).

Greene and Forster (2003) concluded “by far the most important reason black and Hispanic students are underrepresented in college is the failure of the K-12 education system to prepare them for college, rather than insufficient financial and/or inadequate affirmative action policies” (p. 11). Indeed, only 9% of Black students as well as 9% of Latino students are college-ready from the pool of qualified college applicants (Greene & Forster, 2003).

The urban setting. Inner city students often live in neighborhoods that are riddled with crime and violence. This, coupled with evidence of malnutrition, inadequate housing, inferior medical care, and family disruption pose risks that impact severely on students’ academic achievement and ability to concentrate in school (Kopetz, et al., 2006). Family mobility and limited English proficiency add to the frustrations that urban students face (Knapp & Shields, 1990). Knapp and Shields commented:

Some children are doubly disadvantaged, first, because their patterns of behavior, language use, and values do not match those required in the school setting; and second, because teachers and administrators fail to adapt to and take advantage of the strengths that these students do possess. (p. 755)

As a result, teachers or researchers who do not consider the cultural context of minority students often suggest solutions that, despite good intentions, are short-sighted and not centrally relevant to the problem.

Identity issues and cultural responsiveness. Adolescence is a particularly turbulent time for students of color where the struggle to establish identity is viewed through a racial/ethnic lense: “Who am I as an African American . . . Who am I as a Latino?” (DeLorenzo, 2012b). For students of color, however, race and ethnicity, as well as power, class, gender, and sexual orientation, play a central role in developing a sense

of self and possibilities for the future (Swanson, Spencer, Dell'Angelo, Harpalani, & Spencer, 2002; Goldstein, 2007).

Because music teachers have the potential for deeply influencing their students (Bergee, 2001; Rickels, Council, Fredrickson, Hairston, Porter, & Schmidt, 2010), it is important to recognize the critical link between the student's culture and his or her identity (Fitzpatrick, 2012; Kincheloe & Hayes, 2007; Ladson-Billings, 2008; Noguero, 2008; Swanson et al., 2002). Culturally responsive educators acknowledge that culture is a major agent in shaping identity for students of color (Kincheloe, 2007; Swanson et al., 2002; Noguero, 2008).

Stereotypical thinking, however, promotes a deficit perspective, that is, viewing the student in terms of his or her deficiencies rather than strengths (Alonso, 2009). "African American males are perhaps the most highly stigmatized and stereotyped group in American society" (Swanson, et al., 2002, p. 83). Unfortunately, it is not uncommon for teachers to have lower expectations for students of color versus students of non-color (Alonso, 2009; Swanson, et al., 2002) When this occurs in a music setting, teachers may have a different standard for the student's technical/performance skills and perhaps are less likely to select students of color for leadership positions (i.e., section leader, drum major). Palmer, (2011) suggested that low expectations for students of color can also influence their auditions for college. Further, Palmer stated "students of color aspiring to become music teachers face access challenges to general higher education as well as challenges unique to the music admission process. Those challenges include the audition, music style preference, and experience, as well as curriculum" (p. 13).

Vocational Identity: How Students of Color Perceive Career Options

A critical factor in students' decision to pursue a career is related to the student's perception of a career as a viable option. How do urban minority students develop a career orientation? One factor is the degree to which a student has developed career self-efficacy, or the belief that he or she can be successful in a career (Constantine, Erikson, Banks, & Timberlake, 1998; Gushue, Clark, Pantzer, & Scanlan, 2006). Another factor is what Diemer (2007) called "vocational hope." In other words, some students are more likely to explore careers that they have identified in their future goals.

Along these lines, Ladany, Melincoff, Constantine, and Love (1997) surveyed urban high school students and found students who had difficulties relating to an occupation had little or no identity with a particular career and tended to dismiss suggestions of possible careers. In terms of becoming a teacher, Mack and Jackson (1993) as well as Su (2009) found that Latino youth identified low salary, low prestige, and absence of positive information about teaching with a career in professional education.

Other studies recognize a strong relationship between career development and school engagement (i.e., Flores-Gonzalez, 2002; Kenny, Blustein, Haase, Jackson, & Perry, 2006; Ladanay, Melincoff, Constantine, & Love, 1997). The need to find a niche is a prevalent theme in the literature (Albert, 2006; Flores-Gonzalez, 2002). Kincheloe (2007) suggested that creating a sense of belonging in the classroom, the school, and the community, is essential in promoting "personal and social transformation" (p. 6). According to Hurtado and Carter (1977), the sense of belonging may be key to understanding why some students of color persist and achieve. The instrumental music

teachers in Albert's study (2006), for example, felt that a sense of family in the ensemble contributed to the retention of students in low socio-economic school districts.

A few authors (Bradley, 2007; Fitzpatrick, 2011; Koza, 2008) have investigated the issue of race in music education, which may be the starting point for thinking about the issues of race more deeply. However, most music education research has focused on solutions rather than a systematic inquiry about the nature of the problem itself. Additionally, research in music education has not explored first-hand accounts of Black and Latino pre-service and in-service music educators. This is problematic as "researchers unfamiliar with the historical and structural difference of cultures continue to define the problems and develop solutions based on models that are applicable to the majority population" (Freeman, 1977, p. 548). Therefore, it is the intent of this research to explore first-hand accounts of Black and Latino music students/teachers as a means of identifying possible reasons for the underrepresentation of this group in music education.

Context

We are two White females who have a profound interest in understanding why so few students of color enter college music education programs. Because our research is situated in the northeast, we chose to focus on the two largest minority groups in this region, Black or African Americans and Latinos. Universities and public schools in other parts of the country might see greater concentrations of other minorities such as American Indians or Pacific Islanders who may encounter different experiences than are noted in this article. According to the United States Census of 2010 (Humes, Jones, and Ramirez, 2011) and the New Jersey Census of 2010 (U.S. Census Bureau, 2010), the percentage breakdown of Black or African American persons and persons of Hispanic or

Latino origin (this is the language used from the most recent Census Report) is as follows: Black or African American = 13.7% (New Jersey) and 12.6% (United States); Hispanic or Latino = 17.7% (New Jersey) and 16.3% (United States).

The participants from our study were all from the Northern and Central New Jersey. Further, our research included only students and teachers from urban settings, given the high concentration of the Black and Latino student population as well as the unique challenges that urban students face in the schooling process.

Although our university is located in New Jersey, a state with one of the highest levels of diversity, our general university population has 62% White students, 13% Latino students, and 10% African American students (U.S. College Search, 2015). In terms of our music education program, the distribution of Black/Latino students and White students reflects an even wider gulf. Of the 182 undergraduate music education majors in our School of Music, only 17 (9%) are Black, 13 (7%) are Latino, and 152 (84%) are White. In terms of this study, the ratio of White students to Black and Latino students is generally similar to other universities where our research took place.

Method

On the whole, we would describe the methodology used for this study as descriptive research. This design looks at a holistic view of *what is*. As such, our methodological purposes were to obtain data on the current status of Black and Latino music undergraduates and educators in the Northern New Jersey areas; obtain valid data on the current status of Black and Latino music educators and alumni of our institution; to establish relationships among variables that affect Black and Latino music undergraduates and educators; to gain insight into Black and Latino music

undergraduates and educators' current lives; and to determine emergent themes within and inclusive of our subjects. We utilized quantitative data gathering tools (see Appendices A and B) and qualitative data gathering tools (see Appendices C and D), primarily in the form of semi-structured interviews. Our research was approved by the Institutional Review Board at Montclair State University.

We investigated two sub-groups: (a) undergraduate music education majors at three public universities in Northern New Jersey and (b) alumni of our institution who are current public school music educators. Three undergraduates and four alumni took part in the study for a total of seven participants in this research. Although comparatively small, given the low numbers of minority students present in Northern New Jersey music teacher preparation programs and previous music education students from our institution, the seven participants of this study represent an adequate sample size for identifying emerging patterns of commonality among the participants.

The undergraduate music education majors self-selected via two mass-e-mails to music education majors at three public institutions. Emails were sent to all music education students starting at the sophomore level with a total of approximately 50-60 students at each school. Freshmen were excluded from the population because we felt that the participants needed to have a least one year of adjustment to the college setting in terms of social issues and completion of field work. It was not possible to retrieve information that indicated the race of each student thus we had to rely on self-selection for our participant pool.

As was explained in the introductory e-mail, undergraduate students who self-selected to participate in the study must have met the following criteria: (a) Black or

Latino race/ethnicity or mixed race, (b) graduation from an urban high school, and (c) sophomore level or higher. Consenting participants then received and completed a general background survey. Upon completion of the background survey, we arranged to meet the individual undergraduates at a location of their choosing for interviews. The interviews were semi-structured and were audio recorded with the exception of one participant who declined the audio recording option. The validity of the data became clear when we noticed emergent themes across the participants of the study.

In terms of the backgrounds of the undergraduate participants, we were unable to identify trends in the background responses given the small sample size. However, all of the students studied their instrument exclusively in the school music program and none participated in regional or all-state ensembles and or outside music activities prior to entering college.

Our university alumni (1-8 years after graduation) were sent an e-mail via our alumni relations office. Similar to the first sub-group, alumni also self-selected and met the following criteria: (a) Black or Latino race/ethnicity or mixed race, (b) graduated from an urban high school, and (c) were currently public school music educators. Like the undergraduate sub-group, consenting participants then received and completed a general background survey. Upon completion of the background survey, we arranged to meet the individual alumni at a location of their choosing for interviews.

Again, the small sample size precluded any comment on trends in the responses about background. As with the music education students, the participants studied their instrument through the school music program but one participant also indicated that he or she took a few private lessons, though not on a consistent basis. Most of the interviewees

participated in a variety of music activities before college, including regional or all-state ensembles.

Analysis of Data

This research was grounded in the belief that it is critical to listen to the experiences and ideas of Black and Latino music education students and teachers. A survey alone could not capture the comprehensive nature of this conversation. For that reason, an interview with each participant allowed for a richer profile of data. Interviews were transcribed and coded along the main questions of our inquiry (see Appendices C and D and below sub-headings). In an effort to maintain anonymity in the analysis below, participants are identified with pseudonyms.

1. Was culture shock a factor when entering a college music education program?

All participants indicated a strong level of discomfort when they first came to college. Because they graduated from urban high schools with a student body of 95% to 99% students of color, it is not surprising that the predominantly White college climate precipitated a level of culture shock: “It doesn’t feel like home,” “I felt singled out,” “It was overwhelming.” Jorge explained that the general demeanor of White students—how they talked and interacted—created a considerable disconnect from the familiarity of his home school.

“Not everyone was open and friendly about my background,” Melanie reported, “Am I the only one who’s weird? . . . The first year was really difficult.” Trevan said that the differences in color were not nearly as astonishing as the class differences: “I noticed the brand name clothing that students wore and the expensive instruments that students owned.”

Ironically, after a while, Angel returned home to find that the assimilation to this new culture created problems related to the perception of friends and family. He confronted complaints for talking White or acting White. Upon graduation from the music education program, he stated, “So one minute I’m the black sheep of my family because I graduated from college and didn’t impregnate someone when I was young and at the same time when I go to suburbia (I hate to be blunt) that’s when I’m a spick.”

Both undergraduates and teachers were asked what it was like pursuing or having a teaching career in a White dominated profession. Lewis expressed the concern, “I only see White teachers—will I be left out of the profession?” Teacher participants also spoke about the scarcity of teachers of color in their own schools: “I’m the only Hispanic in this school. I feel like an outsider.” Angel and Thomas spoke about faculty insensitivity that they encountered in their own schools. In one case a colleague exclaimed, “You don’t have an accent,” [referring to his speech]. In another case, Angel talked about having a personal conversation with a Spanish-speaking colleague in Spanish, while another faculty member chastised them for not speaking English. Although these comments may seem innocuous to some, the assumptions behind the comments were clearly hurtful to these undergraduates and teachers.

2. What discourages high school students from considering music teaching as a career?

“You’re not going to make any money. Be a lawyer, a doctor, or go into business. It’s a stupid choice.” Some of these messages came from parents and some from high school teachers or guidance counselors. Many parents initially expressed dismay but most eventually became supportive of their son’s/daughter’s choice to apply to a music

education program. The issue, said Lewis, is “what career will pay the most rather than what career you will enjoy the most.” Given the fact that most parents typically had blue collar jobs and worked long hours, music teaching was viewed as a non-profitable profession. “In a Hispanic family,” commented Trevan, “you are the breadwinner.” Immigrant parents or those who may not have had positive experiences with the educational system often had difficulty understanding teaching as a viable profession.

Because peer advice was so important to adolescents, their friend’s comments held particular weight in thinking about music teaching as a career: “I got shunned; music’s not where it’s at; going into music is the dumbest move.” Surprisingly, college participants also encountered unwanted assumptions about their ethnicity or backgrounds: “Here comes the Mexican man,” as well as “Are you from a gang?” Although the comments were not meant to be malicious or hurtful, they illustrated how little some White students knew about students of color. Melanie said, “I felt I had to prove myself as a musician, an African American, and as a woman.”

In terms of wanting to be a music teacher, participants experienced mixed messages about the perceived value of music in the public schools. Participants implied that the lack of resources emphasized the unimportance of music. Materials were outdated and students were often (but not always) unprepared for a college music program. The lack of private lessons was especially upsetting for all participants who felt that this put them at a strong disadvantage when they entered the college music program. “Lower socio-economic programs are depressed. They give little access to music,” commented LaTisha. It is important to note, however, that not all urban schools reflected the aforementioned portrait. For instance, two of the participants, who attended the same

high school, talked about their extraordinary music experiences ranging from participation in a large variety of music ensembles to music theory classes. The lack of private lessons, though, continued to surface as a much needed resource in all of the participant's comments.

3. What advice can participants give to high school teachers and college educators?

The participants were inspired by teachers who pushed hard and had high standards. They also responded positively, said Melanie, to teachers who are a “bomb of enthusiasm.” Others responded, “Let students know that they can make it . . .” “Tell me I can make it to the same place as you” “Hey, you’re good at this.” While good music teachers say such phrases often, it was important to know that the talented urban students especially needed to hear these sentiments. In a very concrete way, they needed to know that they could succeed if they worked diligently toward that goal.

Throughout the interviews, participants emphasized the significance of private lessons which put students on an even “playing field” with other college music applicants. They also emphasized the significance of in-and-out-of school performance opportunities such as regional ensembles, church-based performances, preparatory programs, or even at Board of Education meetings. Moreover, students needed help from the music teacher in preparing for auditions and familiarizing them with the audition process.

A significant event for high school juniors and seniors was career day when people from different professions shared information about their particular job. “In the affluent schools,” commented Trevan, “students get to talk with high level professionals in the medical, law, arts education, etc. fields, but, in the urban schools blue collar careers

are emphasized.” Students, particularly in the urban schools, would benefit from exposure to “intelligent, goal-oriented” professionals representing a range of careers.

For college educators, there were also words of advice. For instance, when colleges send recruiters to visit a high school music program it is important to include professors or college students of color. This is not always easy since, as this research has suggested, there is a dearth of teachers/students of color in music education. However, participants stressed the need for high school students to see that people who look like them can succeed as music educators. “Don’t bring the blonde guy as the only representative,” Trevan remarked, “High school students think: What does he know about us? Oh they’re just trying to throw the book at us. We don’t need that.” In contrast, Lewis was highly influenced to consider music teaching when a senior music education student who was White visited the school. He felt that the visitor familiarized students with the college environment as well as the music program.

Scholarships, not suprisingly, were imperative in the recruitment of students of color. Jorge said, “Show students that there’s a future in music education, that it isn’t going to cost an arm or a leg. In the end it is dollars and cents that influence parental support. Money is the driving factor.” In terms of the college faculty, LaTisha thought it would be beneficial to hold workshops with urban students or visit the urban schools to understand the challenges that urban students face in the educational system. In turn, colleges are able to send ambassadors to the high school who understand the urban struggle. She said, further, “Undergraduates should go into the urban school early and often. With practicums and field experiences in urban settings, preservice teachers get to see different cultures.”

Melanie felt that colleges should offer courses relevant to urban education: “The courses are always about pedagogy and general issues—perhaps a course on adolescent behavior would be helpful.” She felt that college students aren’t prepared for the baggage that students bring to school. Her story illustrates this point:

There’s a single mom with three kids who is working two jobs. It’s not that she isn’t doing her best but all of a sudden the older brother is involved in a gang or some criminal activity. The youngest one’s a really good kid and the middle one sees the oldest and wonders, ‘which way do I go?’

“And how do you handle that?,” Melanie asked, indicating that college students need specific stories to ponder and discuss. Although some of these stories are relevant to all school settings, it goes without saying that White students can learn a great deal from meaningful discussions about the struggles of urban children/adolescents and the kinds of remarks or beliefs that are insensitive to students of color. According to Melanie, “There are a lot of White teachers who want to be in the urban schools and they do care but their experience is not what the inner city kid experiences so there’s a disconnect.”

At the end of the interview, LaTisha asked, “With all the musical experiences that children/adolescents have in their personal life, why aren’t they going into music? Why aren’t we getting at least a quarter of them?” This is precisely the question that our research explores because, according to Angel, “there’s a lot of hidden talent in the urban schools and these students never get a chance.” Although this analysis does not, under any circumstances, claim to represent the voices of all Black or Latino undergraduates and teachers, it attempts to hear the remarks among the participants in this study and consider themes that emerged from their voices. In a state as diverse as New Jersey, however, it does uncover some surprising issues that students of color face when considering a music teaching career.

Considerations and Implications for Music Education

The fact that so few Black and Latino students consider music teaching as a future goal is clearly multi-faceted and goes beyond simplistic solutions. Perhaps the most important finding to emerge from this data is that Black and Latino students/teachers have experiences that can inform the way we support future students of color. The participants' stories and rich conversations, however, suggest that we can also learn much about why so few Black and Latino students enter music education by listening to the voices of those who have been marginalized.

When listening to participants' stories and examining the related literature, it became particularly important to separate the unique challenges that students of color faced from those that other students face when pursuing a professional music teaching career. For example, data from the interviews suggested that while most entering freshmen need a period of adjustment to the college environment, this is exacerbated for students of color by their need to assimilate into a dominant White culture. Further, without models of color in the public school or support specifically directed to minority students, it is doubtful that the students or their parents would even entertain music teaching within the realm of career possibilities. Hamann and Walker (1993) investigated race, among other variables, as an influential factor in music teacher role models for African-American students. One finding suggested that African-American students responded more favorably to music teachers of the same race. These teacher role models were significantly related to students' positive interest in continuing music participation beyond the high school level

Lastly, most (but not all) urban schools are distinctly disadvantaged in terms of music resources and music opportunities. This not only devalues music as a career but also, especially in the area of private lessons, impedes students of color from entering the program on an even footing with their peers. To major in music education, then, as an urban schooled student of color, one must traverse an impossibly rugged terrain just to open the door let alone successfully complete a degree program.

So, where do we go from here? Bradley (2007) suggested that talking openly about race in the pre-service classroom is an important step in the right direction. We agree. We hope that by showcasing the voices of preservice and inservice music teachers of color, we are contributing to such a conversation.

Additionally, there are two areas that seem to need the most careful attention. Although music education scholarship can research social justice, until we move to create more socially just conditions (i.e., by valuing the expertise, experiences, and knowledge of all peoples), we are simply engaging in dialogue without any practical ends. Hence, what are the values, expertise, and experiences of urban students of color and do higher education institutions consider such knowledge bases valuable? Do institutions of higher education consider this in creating audition requirements or designing curricula? In other words, whose musics do we teach and why?

Teacher preparation programs need to be better connected with public schools in creating a community of citizens invested in the public good. Public schools are not simply sites for fieldwork and student teacher placements. They are indispensable spaces for promoting and renewing a public invested in democratic citizenship. As such, the public schools and institutions of higher education need to be connected in multiple ways.

Pre-service music teachers, for example, can consistently commit themselves to assisting and interning with public schools, especially those in urban areas. This, in turn, could allow ways for P-12 students to have access to a wider range of future life-building options. In considering this, we are reminded of Goodlad, Mantle-Bromley, & Goodlad (2004) who advised us about “the moral obligation of teachers to ensure equitable access to and engagement in the best possible education for all children and youth” (p. 185).

Also, and for those students of color who are part of a music education teacher preparation programs, we need to create support-systems that help to minimize culture shock. Questions for consideration in this area are: How does the university music department assist those urban minority students who gain entrance to the institution? As Berry (1990) suggested, minority students feel culture shock from a variety of perspectives. As such, retention of urban music education students of color becomes problematic and music teacher preparation programs might either provide quality tutoring and remedial course work. Sometimes, though, when such remedial course work is supplied there is often a stigma attached so that students generally do not seek out assistance (Berry, 1990). At the same time, Berry pointed out that “Black students often complain that professors treat them like remedial students” (p. 112). One possible approach might prompt a faculty member, sensitive to the needs of students of color, to establish social support groups specifically for and with preservice urban music educators of color.

There is much more research to be done in this area. If anything, our research calls attention to the cyclical nature of teacher diversity. Without greater diversity in the music teaching profession, fewer students of color have reasons to consider music

education as a career which further accentuates the absence of teachers of color in the schools. More importantly, without music teachers of color, all students stand to lose the benefits of the different perspectives and wonderful discourse that teachers of color can bring to the music classroom.

References

- Albert, D. J. (2006). Strategies for the recruitment and retention of band students in low socioeconomic school districts. *Contributions to Music Education, 33*(2), 53-72. Retrieved from <http://search.proquest.com/docview/222276656?accountid=12536>
- Alonso, G. (2009). The culture trap. In G. Alonso, N. S. Anderson, C. Su, & J. Theoharis (Eds.), *Our schools suck* (pp. 31-67). New York: New York University Press.
- Baker, V. D. (2012). Profile of an effective urban music educator. *Update: Applications of Research in Music Education, 3*(1), 44-54. doi: 10.1177/87551233122458293.
- Bergee, M. J. (2001). *Influences on collegiate students' decision to become a music educator*. Retrieved from <http://www.menc.org/networks/rnc/Bergee-Report.html>
- Berry, Jr., L. (1990). Strategies for the recruitment and retention of minority music students. *Proceedings of the 65th Annual Meeting of the National Association of Schools of Music*, vol. 112, Reston, VA: National Association for Schools of Music.
- Bierda, S. & Chait, R. (2011). *Increasing teacher diversity: Strategies to improve the teacher work force*. Washington DC: Center for American Progress.
- Boser, U. (2011). *Teaching diversity matters: A state-by-state analysis of teachers of color*. Washington DC: Center for American Progress.
- Bradley, D. (2007). The sounds of silence: Talking race in music education. *Action, Criticism, and Theory for Music Education, 6*(4), 132-162.
- Constantine, M. G., Erikson, C. D., Banks, R. W., & Timberlake, T. L. (1998). Challenges to the career development of urban racial and ethnic minority youth:

- Implications for vocational intervention. *Journal of Multicultural Counseling & Development*, 26(2), 82-94.
- Costa-Giomi, E. & Chappell, E. (2007). Characteristics of band programs in a large urban school district: Diversity or inequality? *Journal of Band Research*, 42(2), 1-18.
- DeLorenzo, L. C. (2012a). Missing faces in the orchestra: An issue of social justice? *Journal of Music Education*, 98(4), 39-46. doi: 10.1177/0027432112443263.
- DeLorenzo, L. C. (2012b). *Sketches in democracy: Notes from an urban classroom*. Lanham, MD: Rowman & Littlefield.
- Diemer, M. A. (2007). Vocational hope and vocational identity: Urban adolescents' career development. *Journal of Career Assessment*, 15(1), 98-118. doi:10.1177/1069072706294528.
- Elpus, K. & Abril, C. R. (2011). High school music ensemble students in the United States: A demographic profile. *Journal of Research in Music Education*, 59(2), 129-145. doi: 10.1177/0022429411405207.
- Flores-González, N. (2002). *School kids/street kids: Identity development in latino students*. New York: Teachers College, Columbia University.
- Fitzpatrick, K. R. 2011. A Mixed methods portrait of urban instrumental music teaching. *Journal of Research in Music Education*, 59(3), 229-256. doi: 10.1177/0022429411414912.
- Fitzpatrick, K. R. (2012). Cultural diversity and the formation of identity: Our role as music educators. *Music Educators Journal*, 98(4), 53-59. doi: 10.1177/0027432112442903.

- Freeman, K. (1977). Increasing African Americans' participation in higher education: African American high school students' perspectives. *The Journal of Higher Education* 68(5), 523-550.
- Goodlad, J. I., Mantle-Bromley, C., & Goodlad, S. J. (2004). *Education for everyone: Agenda for education in a democracy*. San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass.
- Greene, J. P. & Forster, G. (2003). *Public high school graduation and college readiness rates in the United States* (Research Report No. 3). Retrieved from http://www.manhattan-institute.org/html/ewp_03.htm
- Gushue, G. V., Clark, C. P., Pantzer, K. M., & Scanlan, K. R. L. (2006). Self-Efficacy, perceptions of barriers, vocational identity, and the career exploration behavior of Latino/a high school students. *The Career Development Quarterly*, 54(4), 307-317.
- Haberman, M. (1999). Increasing the number of high-quality African American teachers in urban schools. *Journal of Instructional Psychology*, 26(4), 207-214.
- Hamann, D. L. & Walker, L. M. (1993). Music teachers as role models for African-American students. *Journal of Research in Music Education*, 41(4), 303-314.
- Humes, K. R., Jones, N. A. & Ramirez, R. R. (2011). Overview of race and Hispanic origin. *US Census Bureau*, Issue March 2011. Retrieved from <http://www.census.gov/prod/cen2010/briefs/c2010br-02.pdf>
- Hurtado, S. & Carter, D. F. (1977). Transition and perceptions of the campus racial climate on Latino college students' sense of belonging. *Sociology of Education*, 70(4), 324-345.

- Kenny, M. E., Blustein, D. L., Haase, R. F., Jackson, J., & Perry, J. C. (2006). Setting the stage: Career development and the student engagement process. *Journal of Counseling Psychology, 53*(2), 272-279. doi: 10.1037/0022-0167.53.2.272.
- Kinney, D. W. (2010). Selected nonmusic predictors of urban students' decisions to enroll and persist in middle school band programs. *Journal of Research in Music Education, 57*(4), 334-350.
- Kincheloe, J. L. (2007). City kids—Not the kind of students you'd want to teach. In J. L. Kincheloe & K. Hayes (Eds.), *Teaching city kids* (pp. 3-38). New York: Peter Lang.
- Knap, M. & Shields, P. (1990). Reconceiving academic instruction for the children of poverty. *Phi Delta Kappan, 71*(10), 753-758.
- Kopet, P. B., Lease, A. J., & Warren-Kring, B. Z. (2006). *Comprehensive urban education*. Boston: Pearson.
- Koza, J. E. (2008). Listening for Whiteness: Hearing racial politics in undergraduate school music. *Philosophy of Music Education Review, 16*(2), 146-145.
- Kozol, J. (2005). *The shame of the nation*. New York: Three Rivers Press.
- Ladany, N., Melincoff, D. S., Constantine, M. G., & Love, R. (1997). At-risk urban high school students' commitment to career choices. *Journal of Counseling and Development, 76*(1), 45-52.
- Ladson-Billings, G. (2008). Yes, but how do we do it?: Practicing culturally relevant pedagogy. In W. Ayers, G. Ladson-Billings, G. Michie, & P. A. Noguero (Eds.), *City kids, city schools: More reports from the front row* (pp. 162-177). New York: The New Press.

- Lucas, T. & Robinson, J. (2003). Reaching them early: Identifying and supporting prospective teachers. *Journal of Education for Teaching*, 29(2), 159-175.
doi:10.1080/0260747032000098444
- Mack, F. R. P. & Jackson, T. E. (1993). *Teacher education as a career choice of Hispanic high school seniors*. East Lansing, MI: National Center for Research on Teaching Learning.
- Noguero, P. N. (2008). *The trouble with black boys: And other reflections on race, equity, and the future of public education*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.
- Olsen, B. & Anderson, L. (2007). Courses of action: A qualitative investigation into urban teacher retention and career development. *Urban Education*, 42(5), 5-29.
doi: 10.1177/0042085906293923.
- Palmer, C. . (2011). Challenges of access to post-secondary music education programs for people of color. *Visions of Research in Music Education*, 18. Retrieved from <http://www-usr.rider.edu/~vrme/v18n1/index.html>
- Quiocho, A. & Rios, R. (2000). The power of their presence: Minority group teachers and schooling. *Review of Educational Research*, 70(4), 485-528.
- Rickels, D. A., Councill, K. H., Fredrickson, W. E., Hairston, M. J., Porter, A. M., & Schmidt, M. (2010). Influences on career choice among music education audition candidates: a pilot study. *Journal of Research in Music Education*, 57(4), 292-307. doi:10.1177/002242909350779.
- Spearman, C. E. (1999). How will societal and technological changes affect the teaching of music? In NAFME, *Housewright symposium on the future of music*.

- Symposium conducted at the meeting of the Housewright Symposium on the Future of Music Education, Tallahassee, FL.
- Swanson, D. P., Spencer, M. B., Dell'Angelo, T., Harpalani, V., & Spencer, T. R. (2002). Identity processes and the positive youth development of African Americans: An explanatory framework. *New Directions for Youth Development*, 95, 73-99.
- Su, C. (2009). Where youth have an actual voice. In G. Alonso, N. S. Anderson, C. Su, & J. Theoharis (Eds.), *Our schools suck* (pp. 143-175). New York: New York University Press.
- Tyler, L., Whiting, B., Ferguson, S., Eubanks, S., Steinberg, J., Scatton, L., & Bassett, K. (2011). *Toward increasing teacher diversity: Targeting support and intervention for teacher licensure candidates*. National Education Association & Educational Testing Service: Washington, DC, Princeton, NJ.
- U.S. Census Bureau (2010). Quick facts: New Jersey. Retrieved from <http://factfinder.census.gov/faces/tableservices/jsf/pages/productview.xhtml?src=bkmk>
- U. S. College Search. (2015). *Montclair state university*. Retrieved from <http://www.uscollegesearch.org/montclair-state-university.html>

Appendix A

General Background Survey: Music Education Student

Thank you for your willingness to participate in this research project. The project explores attitudes and career aspirations of students who are Black/African American, Latino or a combination of both races/ethnicities majoring in music education. This survey is only a means of retrieving background information and will remain anonymous.

Please choose 1 answer for each of the following questions:

1. Which best describes your status?
 - a. Sophomore
 - b. Junior
 - c. Senior
 - d. Second year senior

2. Which best characterizes your entrance to your present college?
 - a. I came as a freshman
 - b. I am a transfer from a county college
 - c. I am a transfer from another 4-year institution
 - d. I transferred my major to music education within the same college.

3. Which best reflects the high school where you graduated?
 - a. Large urban high school
 - b. Smaller urban high school
 - c. A suburban school
 - d. Rural school

4. When did you start to learn your applied instrument (includes voice)?
 - a. Before elementary school
 - b. In elementary school
 - c. In middle school
 - d. In high school
5. How did you study your applied instrument before college?
 - a. I learned primarily in the school music program
 - b. I primarily took private lessons outside the school
 - c. I took lessons in school and also had some private lessons out of school
6. When did you begin to think seriously about teaching music?
 - a. I always wanted to be a teacher
 - b. I started thinking about becoming a music teacher in middle school
 - c. I started thinking about becoming a music teacher in high school
 - d. I started thinking about becoming a music teacher after I graduated from high school.
7. Who was your biggest influence in deciding to major in music education?
 - a. High school music teacher
 - b. Parents or guardian
 - c. Private instrument teacher
 - d. Other
8. Do you feel that you were well prepared to enter a music department?
 - a. Yes, I feel confident and am doing well in all of my music courses

b. For the most part, although I am having trouble in one or two of my music courses

c. No, I feel lost in some of my music courses. Other students seem to have had much more preparation than I had.

d. No, I feel that I was completely unprepared.

9. How many Black or Latino music teachers have you observed in your fieldwork?

a. None

b. One

c. Two

d. Several

10. How many Black/African American or Latino music professors have you experienced in your entire music program?

a. None

b. One

c. Two

d. Several

For this last question, please mark **ALL** that apply.

11. Which of the following activities did you participate in before college?

a. Summer music camp

b. Church choir, solo, or instrument ensemble

c. Regional or All-State Ensembles

d. Recital

e. Ensemble that met after school on a regular basis (e.g. New Jersey Youth Symphony)

f. None of the above

Appendix B

General Background Survey: Music Teacher

Thank you for your willingness to participate in this research project. The project explores attitudes and career aspirations of students who are Black/African American, Latino or a combination of both races/ethnicities majoring in music education. This survey is only a means of retrieving background information and will remain anonymous.

Please choose 1 answer for each of the following questions:

1. Which best describes your current teaching position?
 - a. Urban public school
 - b. Suburban public school
 - c. Rural public school

2. Have you ever taught in an urban school?
 - a. Yes, for _____ years
 - b. No, I did not apply to any urban schools for a teaching position
 - c. No, I did not accept an offer at an urban school

3. Which best describes your level of teaching?
 - a. High School
 - b. Middle School
 - c. Elementary School
 - d. Combination of above

4. Which best describes your area of specialization?
 - a. Instrumental
 - b. Vocal/Choral

- c. General
 - d. Combination of above
5. Which best reflects the high school where you graduated?
- a. Large urban high school
 - b. Smaller urban high school
 - c. A suburban school
 - d. Rural school
6. When did you start to learn your applied instrument (includes voice)?
- a. Before elementary school
 - b. In elementary school
 - c. In middle school
 - d. In high school
7. How did you study your applied instrument before college?
- a. I learned primarily in the school music program
 - b. I primarily took private lessons outside the school
 - c. I took lessons in school and also had some private lessons out of school
8. When did you begin to think seriously about teaching music?
- a. I always wanted to be a teacher
 - b. I started thinking about becoming a music teacher in middle school
 - c. I started thinking about becoming a music teacher in high school
 - d. I started thinking about becoming a music teacher after I graduated from high school.

9. Who was your biggest influence in deciding to major in music education?
- High school music teacher
 - Parents or guardian
 - Private instrument teacher
 - Other (please explain)
10. Do you feel that you were well prepared to enter an undergraduate music education program?
- Yes, I felt confident and did well in most of my music courses
 - For the most part, but I had trouble with a few of my music courses
 - No, I felt lost in some of my music courses. Other students seem to have had much more preparation than I had.
 - No, I felt that I was completely unprepared.
11. How many Black or Latino music teachers did you observe in your undergraduate fieldwork?
- None
 - One
 - Two
 - Several
12. How many Black/African American or Latino music professors did you have in your entire music program? (high school and undergraduate college)
- None
 - One
 - Two

d. Several

For this last question, please mark **ALL** that apply.

13. Which of the following activities did you participate in before college?

a. Summer music camp

b. Church choir, solo, or instrument ensemble

c. Regional or All-State Ensembles

d. Recital

e. Ensemble that met after school on a regular basis (e.g. New Jersey Youth Symphony)

f. None of the above

Appendix C

Semi-Structured Interview Survey for Music Education Students

Instructions to Participants

We are conducting research to understand how music educators can attract more students of color into the music teaching field. We hope that you might be able to help us understand why so few students of color want to become music teachers. The purpose of this interview is to listen to your ideas and opinions regarding students of color entering a music education program.

Please understand that your feedback will remain anonymous. You may decide to leave the interview at any time without penalty. If you are uncomfortable or have nothing to say about any of the questions we have for you, please feel free to not participate for that question. We appreciate that you are giving of your free time for this interview and anticipate that your ideas will be of great benefit to the music teaching profession.

May we audiotape this session? The tape will only be accessible to us and kept in a locked file drawer.

1. Why did you decide to major in music education? What made you think about becoming a music educator?
2. How did your family feel about your decision to become a music teacher?
3. How many students of color would you estimate are in the music education program?
4. Why do you think there so few music education student of color when compared to White students? (e.g. strength of high school music program, teacher status)

5. What advice would you give to your high school teachers or students of color in high school if they want to teach music?
6. What does it mean to you to become a teacher of color in a primarily White profession?
7. What kind of school would you most like to teach in when you finish your program? (urban, suburban, rural) Why?
8. What do you think colleges could do better to prepare students to work with a diverse population?

Appendix D

Semi-Structured Interview Survey for Music Teachers

Instructions to Participants

We are conducting research to understand how music educators can attract more students of color into the music teaching field. We hope that you might be able to help us understand why so few students of color want to become music teachers. The purpose of this interview is to listen to your ideas and opinions regarding students of color entering a music education program.

Please understand that your feedback will remain anonymous. You may decide to leave the interview at any time without penalty. If you are uncomfortable or have nothing to say about any of the questions we have for you, please feel free to not participate for that question. We appreciate that you are giving of your free time for this interview and anticipate that your ideas will be of great benefit to the music teaching profession.

May we audiotape this session? The tape will only be accessible to us and kept in a locked file drawer.

1. Why did you decide to major in music education? What made you think about becoming a music educator?
2. How did your family feel about your decision to become a music teacher?
3. How many students of color would you estimate were in your high school music program? What about your music education program in college?
4. Did you experience any “culture” shock when you first came to college? What kinds of experiences did you encounter?

5. Why do you think there so few music education students of color when compared to White students?
6. What does it mean to you to be a teacher of color in a primarily White profession?
7. What advice would you give to students of color who may be thinking about a music teaching career?
8. What do you think colleges could do better to prepare students to work with a diverse population?
9. What do you think public school teachers could do to attract more students of color into music teaching?

Lisa C. DeLorenzo (delorenzol@mail.montclair.edu) is a professor of music education and graduate coordinator of music education at Montclair State University where her research interests and teaching include teaching democratic practice in music education, diversity and social justice, music teacher education and creative and critical thinking. In addition journal articles, she is author of *Sketches in Democracy: Lessons From An Urban Classroom* (Rowman & Littlefield, 2012) and editor of *Giving Voice to Democracy in Music Education: Diversity and Social Justice* (Routledge, 2015). She received the 2014 Mandela Award for Outstanding Leadership in Diversity at Montclair State University. Her teaching experience includes elementary through college. DeLorenzo holds an Ed.D. from Teachers College, Columbia University; an M.M.E. from Indiana University; and a Bachelor of Science in Music Education from West Chester University.

Marissa Silverman (silvermanm@mail.montclair.edu) is Associate Professor at the John J. Cali School of Music, Montclair State University, NJ. A Fulbright Scholar, Dr. Silverman has published invited chapters in recent Oxford University Research Handbooks, as well as journal articles in the *International Journal of Music Education*, the *British Journal of Music Education*, *Action, Criticism, and Theory for Music Education*, *Research Studies in Music Education*, *Music Education Research*, the *International Journal of Community Music*, *Visions of Research in Music Education*, as well as *The New York Times*. Her research agenda focuses on dimensions of music education philosophy, general music, artistic interpretation, music teacher education, community music, and interdisciplinary curriculum development. Dr. Silverman is also co-author (with David Elliott) of the 2nd edition of *Music Matters: A Philosophy of Music Education* (Oxford University Press). She is co-editor of *Community Music Today* (Rowman & Littlefield) and the forthcoming *Artistic Citizenship: Artistry, Social Responsibility, and Ethical Praxis* (Oxford University Press). As a secondary school teacher, Dr. Silverman taught band, general music, and English literature at Long Island City High School (Queens, New York).